



Tord Riemann <tordriemann@googlemail.com>

EPJ C: ZFitter/GFitter case

2 messages

Caron, Christian, Springer DE <Christian.Caron@springer.com>

Wed, Nov 2, 2011 at 6:26 PM

To: Tord Riemann <tordriemann@googlemail.com>

Cc: bethke@mppmu.mpg.de, Gino.Isidori@Inf.infn.it, odintsov@ieec.uab.es, epjc@sif.it

Dear Dr Tord Riemann:

I am writing to you following a preliminary inquiry by myself and the Editors-in-Chief of The European Physical Journal C regarding a matter of alleged plagiarism you have brought to our attention as spokesperson of the Zfitter collaboration.

The EPJ C publication concerned is

Revisiting the global electroweak fit of the Standard Model and beyond with Gfitter

The European Physical Journal C - Particles and Fields ; Volume 60, Number 4, 543-583, DOI: 10.1140/epjc/s10052-009-0966-6 ; H. Flächer, M. Goebel, J. Haller, A. Hoecker, K. Mönig und J. Stelzer

and the corresponding erratum:

Erratum to: Revisiting the global electroweak fit of the Standard Model and beyond with Gfitter

The European Physical Journal C - Particles and Fields; Volume 71, Number 8, 1718, DOI: 10.1140/epjc/s10052-011-1718-y ; H. Flächer, M. Goebel, J. Haller, A. Hoecker, K. Mönig und J. Stelzer

by the Gfitter collaboration, where - so we understand -

- the Erratum now explicitly refers to a computer program (and published documentation about this program) the original publication is based on, allegedly without explicit consent from the ZFitter collaboration.

- the Erratum corrects for the missing acknowledgements of the moral rights of authorship in the original article, while you assume it still does not resolve the issue of exploitation rights concerning the ZFitter program by the GFitter collaboration.

The preliminary evidence gathered leads us to conclude that, at present, there is no comprehensive allegation, since we have not all elements at hand to come to a final conclusion and we are, therefore, not in a position to provide a concluding statement on the situation. Nevertheless, due to the ongoing discussions in the scientific community, we could investigate the case in more depth upon further request by the party offended (henceforth called the complainant for definiteness).

If so wished, we need as next step to formalize the procedure, which has been conducted so far on a largely informal and information-gathering basis.

This is necessary in order to

- properly identify the complainant and to distinguish, if need be, that party from the past and present ZFitter group membership.
- assess the relevance of various national laws and terms of employment contracts involved regarding the possible rights of the complainants' employers at the time of writing the computer program.
- to assess the contribution by each individual member of the complainant with respect to the computer program and thus also with respect to the previous and present composition of the ZFitter membership.

For this I would require a formal letter signed by the complainant (i.e. all members constituting the offended party), stating briefly the object of accusation as well as detailing the contribution each signing member has contributed to the writing of the computer program.

This must be accompanied, for every member signing this letter, by an official document signed by the employer at the time of writing the software that identifies the member as full representative of the exploitation rights on the part of the program he/she has contributed to, or otherwise which exploitation rights remain with the employer at the time of writing the software.

Should the complainant have transferred in a legally binding way any exclusive exploitation rights on the computer program to third parties (e.g. publishers, software companies, or other), this must be mentioned so as to identify such third parties as possible additional right holders in the process.

Once we have received this letter as well as the related documents, we will examine and as the case may be inform the GFitter group of the opening of the official internal investigation.

Yours sincerely

Christian Caron

Executive Publishing Editor

The European Physical Journal

www.epj.org